

**BEFORE THE HON'BLE NATIONAL GREEN TRIBUNAL, NEW DELHI
(PRINCIPAL BENCH)**

I.A. No. 524/2024
In Original Application No. 165 of 2024

In the matter of

Achhru Ram Sharma

..... Applicant


V/s

State of Punjab and Others

..... Respondents

Reply of Er. Gurmit Singh, Environmental Engineer, Regional Office -3, Ludhiana on behalf of Punjab Pollution Control Board in compliance to order dated 22.10.2024 to the application filed by the applicant placing on record certain facts and documents.

RESPECTFULLY SHOWETH

- 1) That the subject cited case is pending for adjudication before the Hon'ble National Green Tribunal.
- 2) That the applicant has filed an application in IA No. 524 of 2024 before this Hon'ble Tribunal placing on record certain facts and documents. After consideration of the matter, the Hon'ble National Green Tribunal has passed an order dated 22.10.2024 thereby directing the respondent Punjab Pollution Control Board to file a response to the I.A No. 524 of 2024. 
- 3) That the applicant in fact has raised objections to the Joint Committee report by filing of IA No. 524 of 2024. The objections raised in the application to the Joint Committee report are summarized herein below.

- a) The concentration of parameters Total Dissolved Solids (TDS) and Sodium Absorption Ratio (SAR) at the outlet of ETP were beyond the prescribed limits. It is alleged that the value of TDS at the outlet of ETP is 3407 mg/l against the prescribed limit of 2100 mg/l and that of SAR is 54 mg/l against the prescribed limit of 26 mg/l.
- b) The Joint Committee has not carried out the analysis of Oil & Grease parameter which is one of the main parameters to be analyzed in case of oil refining unit.
- c) The industry does not have installed Dissolved Air Flootation system and for such an industry, it is almost impossible to control the parameters of Oil & Grease parameter without the installation of Dissolved Air Flootation (DAF) system.
- d) As per the analysis reports of samples collected from 08 locations around the industry by a private laboratory namely M/s Chandigarh Pollution Testing Laboratory, several parameters are exceeding the prescribed limits.
- e) That the parameters of BOD and COD from samples collected from the plantation area have been found to be far beyond the prescribed limits. One of the other parameters, the value of which is exceeding the prescribed limits is lead (Pb).
- f) As per the analysis report, various other parameters such as TDS (at plantation area), hardness, magnesium, chloride, SAR (at plantation area) oil and grease, E.coli bacteria have been found to be beyond the prescribed limits.

REPLY TO THE OBJECTIONS

- 4) That the industry in question namely M/s A.P. Refinery Private Limited is a solvent extraction plant (Edible Oil & Vanaspati industry) situated at Village Tapar Harnia, Tehsil Jagraon, District Ludhiana. The Ministry of Environment, Forest & Climate Change, Government of India has prescribed the specific parameters for Edible Oil & Vanaspati industry at serial no. 67 in the Schedule-1 (Standards for emission or discharge of Environmental Pollutants) appended with the Environment (Protection) Rules, 1986 as amended. The parameters and standards prescribed for Edible Oil & Vanaspati industry under the




Environment (Protection) Rules, 1986 are mentioned in the tabular form hereunder:

S.No.	Industry	Parameters	Standards
1	2	3	4
67	Edible Oil & Vanaspati industry	Effluent	
		Temperature	Not more than 5°C above ambient temperature of the recipient waterbody
		pH	6.5-8.5
		Suspended solids	150 mg/l
		Oil & grease	20 mg/l
		BOD (3 days at 27° C)	100 mg/l
		COD	200 mg/l
		Wastewater Discharge	
		i. Solvent extraction	2.0 cum/tonne of product (oil)
		ii. Refinery/Vanaspati	2.0 cum/tonne of product (refined oil/Vanaspati)
		iii. Integrated unit of extraction & refinery/ Vanaspati	4.0 cum/tonne of refined Vanaspati product
		iv. Barometric cooling water/Deodorise water	15.0 cum/tonne of refined oil Vanaspati
		<p>Note: i. The above standards shall be applicable to waste water form processes and cooling.</p> <p>ii. BOD shall be made stringent upto 30 mg/l if the recipient fresh water body is source of drinking water supply.</p> <p>iii. The standards for boiler emission shall be applicable as prescribed under Schedule I of these rules.</p>	

5) That as per the analysis report of effluent samples issued by the Punjab Pollution Control Board, Zonal Office, Laboratory, Ludhiana which is NABL

Accredited laboratory, the value of relevant parameters in the effluent samples collected from outlet of effluent treatment plant of the industry are given below

- a) pH = 8.3
 - b) Total Suspended Solid = 16 mg/l
 - c) Bio-Chemical Oxygen (BOD) = 16 mg/l
 - d) Chemical Oxygen Demand (COD) = 62 mg/l
 - e) Oil & Grease = Below Detectible Limits (BDL).
- 6) That the Joint Committee has carried out monitoring of the Effluent Treatment Plant with respect to Oil & Grease parameter and its concentration is well within the standards prescribed by the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change, Government of India.
- 7) That the other parameters like Total Dissolved Solids (TDS), Sodium Absorption Ratio (SAR), Mixed Liquid Suspended Solids (MLSS) & Mixed Liquid Volatile Suspended Solids (MLVSS) are the additional parameters checked by the Joint Committee, which have not been prescribed by the MoEF&CC for such type of industrial discharge.
- 8) That the Chandigarh Pollution Testing Laboratory has carried out the monitoring of ground water samples from outside the premises of the industry without any intimation either to the Joint Committee or to the Punjab Pollution Control Board.
- 9) That it is relevant to mention here that industrial unit has installed three oil and grease traps before the Effluent Treatment Plant and the parameter of Oil and Grease was found to be 8.6 mg/l at the inlet of the Effluent Treatment Plant against the prescribed outlet standaprds 20 mg/l. The water analysis report dated 07.05.2024 issued by the Punjab Pollution Control Board, Zonal Laboratory, Ludhiana vide letter endorsement no. 1237-39 dated 07.05.2024 is enclosed as **Annexure-A** for kind perusal and reference. 
- 10) That as the existing Effluent Treatment Plant of the industry meets with the prescribed effluent standards for Oil & Grease parameter, hence there is no need to install a Dissolved Air Floatation (DAF) system as additional component with the Effluent Treatment Plant.

- 11) That the objections raised by the applicant to the Joint Committee report have not any substance and are liable to be rejected in view of the submissions made herein above.
- 12) That the reply of Punjab Pollution Control Board is hereby submitted in compliance to order dated 22.10.2024 for kind consideration of the Hon'ble Tribunal.

Date: 07-02-2025

Place: Ludhiana

Submitted by



(Gurmit Singh)

Environmental Engineer,

Punjab Pollution Control Board

Regional Office-3, Ludhiana

(On behalf of Punjab Pollution Control Board)



Ph. 0161-2676350

Punjab Pollution Control Board

Zonal Laboratory, E-648-B, 2nd Floor,
Phase-5, Focal Point, Ludhiana.

E-mail: ilnppcebidb@gmail.com

Water Analysis Report

1. Laboratory Sample no.: E 27/Zonal Lab/2024
2. Name of Industry : M/s AP Refinery Pvt. Ltd.,
VIII. Tapar, Harnia, Tehsil Jagraon,
Distt. Ludhiana
3. Name of Sample Collecting Officer : Er. Gurmeet Singh, E.E., PPCB RO.3, Ludhiana,
Er. Rajpal Gill, A.E.E., PPCB RO.3, Ludhiana,
Sh. Jagdish Prasad Meena, Scientist, CPCB,
Naima Akhtar Scientist, C, CGWB,
Sh. Gurbir Singh, Kohli, SDM Jagaron.
4. Type of Sample : Grab
5. Date of Sample Collection : 26.04.2024
6. Date of Receiving: 26.04.2024
7. Method Followed IS 3025/ methods of APHA

ਸਾ.ਪ.ਪ.ਸ. ਸੇਵਾਗਾਰ ਕੋਲ ਪ੍ਰਾਚੀਨ.ਪਿ.ਪਿ.ਪਿ. ਵੱਲੋਂ ਲਿਆ
ਨਵੀਂ ਡਾਕ ਨੂੰ ਵਾਤਾ ਵਿੱਚੀ
ਯੂ
ਵਾਤਾ ਵਿੱਚੀ
ਡਾਇਰੀ ਨੰ 112.8 ਮਿਤੀ 09.05/24

Results:

Sr. No.	Parameters	Inlet	Outlet	Aeration Tank-1	Aeration Tank-2	Prescribed Standard
1.	pH	5.3	8.3	-	-	6.5-8.5
2.	Total Suspended Solids (mg/l)	690	16	-	-	150
3.	Total Dissolved Solids (mg/l)	2430	3407	-	-	-
4.	Chemical Oxygen demand (mg/l)	1440	62	-	-	200
5.	Bio-chemical Oxygen Demand (mg/l)	580	16	-	-	100
6.	Oil & Grease (mg/l)	8.6	BDL	-	-	20
7.	Sodium Absorption Ratio (SAR)	-	54.0	-	-	-
8.	Mixed Liquid Suspended Solids (mg/l)	-	-	3560	2850	-
9.	Mixed Liquid Volatile Suspended Solids (mg/l)	-	-	1900	1950	-

Remarks :-

1. BDL means Below Method Detection Limit.
2. If any stringent limits/specific standards have been prescribed time to time by MoEF & CC, CPCB and PPCB, then stringent limits/ specific standards would prevail subject to clarification from the concerned Regional office.

Gurmeet Singh
Junior Scientific Officer,
Zonal Lab, Ludhiana

Dated 07/05/2024

Ends. No. 1237-39

A copy of the above is forwarded to the following for information and necessary action please along with data sheet:-

1. The Chief Environmental Engineer, Punjab Pollution Control Board, Ludhiana.
2. The Senior Environmental Engineer, Punjab Pollution Control Board, Zonal Office-2, Ludhiana.
3. The Environmental Engineer, Punjab Pollution Control Board, Regional Office-3, Ludhiana.

Mint
Scientific Officer,
Zonal Lab, Ludhiana
H/P/M